CARING FOR DYING PARENTS: AN EXISTENTIAL PHENOMENOLOGICAL APPROACH

Submitted by
Lindsay Paul BSc (Adelaide), Grad Dip Community Health (La Trobe)

A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Public Health, Faculty of Health Sciences
La Trobe University
Bundoora, Victoria 3086
AUSTRALIA

September 2002
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

*Summary* iv  
*Statement of Authorship* v  
*Acknowledgements* vi  

## PART ONE

### Chapter One. Introduction

The research project: Caring for a dying parent  
- The research question  
  2

**The idea of ‘caring’**  
- ‘Informal caring’ or just ‘caring’? A question of semantics  
  7
- An existential view: The phenomenon of caring  
  11

**Heidegger’s theory of Being and the existential meaning of death**  
- Heidegger: Care and solicitude  
  15
- The existential understanding of death  
  20
- Confronting death  
  22

**Plan of the thesis**  
  25

### Chapter Two. Phenomenology and Caring in the Nursing Environment

Caring for and caring about  
  30

**The caring relationship**  
  32

**Nursing theories**  
- Parse’s nursing theory; the idea of human becoming  
  35
- Benner and Wrubel’s theory of nursing: The nurse as advocate  
  36
- Watson’s theory of nursing: Transpersonal caring  
  37
- Nursing care and spirituality  
  40
  - Nursing as a covenant  
  40
  - Campbell’s concept of nursing as skilled companionship  
  40
  - Bradshaw: Spiritualism in the Christian tradition  
  44

**A critique of existential nursing theories**  
  45

**Phenomenological nursing research: A review**  
- The nature of care in nursing  
  53

**Summary of the phenomenological perspective in nursing care**  
  59

**Summary and Conclusion**  
  61

### Chapter Three. Methodology

Science and qualitative research  
  63

**Phenomenological theory**  
- Transcendental phenomenology  
  67
- Existential phenomenology  
  68

**Human science practice and research**  
- The application of philosophical procedures to practical research  
  70
  - Alfred Schutz: The phenomenology of the social world  
  73
  - Amedeo Giorgi: Phenomenological psychology  
  76
  - Max van Manen: Researching lived experience  
  78
• Applications of phenomenology 81
  o Clark Moustakas: Loneliness 81
  o Kay Toombs: The meaning of illness and the patient/physician Relationship 82
  o Edward Casey: Remembering 84

The present study 85
• Explanation and justification of method 85
• Selection of participants 94
• Conversations with carers 96
• The hermeneutic process: Identifying the themes 97

Chapter Four. Research Material 98
Primary sources: Conversations with carers 98
• Joan’s story: The author’s experience of caring 99
• Conversation with Anne 102
• Conversation with Zoe 105
• Conversation with Brad 108
• Conversation with Susan 112
• Conversation with Alice 117
• Alice’s journal 122

Additional primary material 132
• Conversation with Kerry 132

Secondary sources 134
• A Very Easy Death 134
• Patrimony: A True Story 136

Conclusion 137

PART TWO

Chapter Five. The World of Caring 139
Mayeroff’s On Caring 141
• Patience, love and caring: Marcel and Fromm 146

Receiving care: The ill person’s experience 149
Providing care: The carer’s experience 151
• Nursing and lay perceptions of caring 151
• Upholding the truth 155
• Nourishing body and soul 157
• Ways of communicating 158
  o Communicating through reminiscence 158
  o Communication through writing 158
  o Communicating through music 159
• Self-deception 162
• Simple comforts 164
• Difficult tasks 165
  o Shame and embarrassment: Intimate tasks 165
  o Decision making 167
• Temporality and spatiality 168
• Reflections on the caring role 173

Conclusion 174
Chapter Six. Hope and Suffering
An existential view of suffering
Theories of suffering and hope
  • Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty
  • Suffering and loneliness
  • Suffering and the fear of death
  • Hope
  • Summary of theories
Stories of suffering and hope
  • Suffering without hope
  • Hope: Discovering new purpose
  • Hope: Overcoming fear
  • Deception
  • Explaining illness
Summary and Conclusion

Chapter Seven. Ways of Knowing the Body
The hidden body: Encounters with technology
  • Images of the interior
  • The aesthetics of imaging technology
  • The medical view of the body’s interior
  • The discursive gap: Undermining lived experience
  • An aberration: Interpreting illness through medical data
  • The implications of technology for carers
  • Images as texts: reading the results
  • The hidden body: Discussion
The dismembered body: Medical specialisation
  • The dismembered body: Discussion
The naked body
  • The naked body: Discussion
Summary and Conclusion

Chapter Eight. Being there
Elements of caring
  • Being-towards-death
  • Major elements of caring for dying parents
    o Temporality and parallel worlds
    o The relief of suffering
    o Responsibility and the “power relationship”
    o Freedom and creativity
    o Reciprocity
    o Deception
    o Death and the totality of Dasein
  • Summary of elements of caring.
Caring: An authentic way of Being
Summary and Conclusion

Appendix A
Appendix B
Bibliography
SUMMARY

The death of one’s parents, irrespective of the age at which it occurs, is generally regarded as a life experience of considerable significance. The last few years of an elderly person’s life are often characterized by increasing frailty, declining health and loss of independence. Responsibility for the spiritual and physical care of parents during that period is undertaken by many adult children. Current research in this area is generally informed by the requirements of social policy, which, by identifying and addressing the inherent difficulties in this so-called informal caring, is designed to support carers in the community. The research reported in this thesis represents a departure from this mode of inquiry and seeks, rather, to explore the existential aspects of caring in this particular situation, from the carer’s perspective.

To achieve this objective, an existential phenomenological approach informed principally by the philosophies of Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty, and the adaptation of these philosophies by Schutz, Giorgi and van Manen to social science research, was developed to suit the particular requirements of the topic. In addition to the author’s autobiographic material, primary sources include conversations with five people who had been principal carers for their parents during their final illnesses. In all cases caring had ended with the parent’s death at least one year before the conversations took place. The principal secondary sources are Simone de Beauvoir’s memoir, A Very Easy Death, and Philip Roth’s account of his father’s illness and death, Patrimony: A True Story. In addition, the argument is supported throughout by reference to other literary works. From these sources a number of major existential themes, including temporality, hope, suffering, and knowing the body, have been explored in depth, in conjunction with relevant existential theories. Synthesis of these topics suggests that in this particular circumstance, for the people involved in the study, the phenomenon of caring can be understood as an unconditional engagement with the life and concerns of their parent at the end of life, and can be interpreted within an existential framework as representing an authentic way of Being.

*   *   *
STATEMENT OF AUTHORSHIP

Except where reference is made in the text of the thesis, this thesis contains no material published elsewhere or extracted in whole or in part from a thesis for any other degree or diploma.

No other person’s work has been used without due acknowledgement in the text of the thesis.

The thesis has not been submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any other tertiary institution.

All research procedures reported in the thesis were approved by the La Trobe University Faculty of Health Sciences Ethics Committee, Approval Number FHEC 96/200

Signed:……………………………………… Date:……………………………

Signed:……………………………………… Date:……………………………
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

No research project can eventuate without the involvement of a great many people. During the time that it has taken to accomplish this work, I have been privileged to meet a number of generous people who have freely offered me their time and expertise, and without whom the task would have been considerably more arduous.

I thank my supervisors, John Wiltshire and Michael McGartland, who have skilfully guided the convergence of their academic perspectives, English and Psychology, which underpins this thesis. John’s gentle spirit and deep humanity are reflected in his knowledge and expertise in the area of illness narrative; these qualities have inspired me to pursue my task with confidence and enthusiasm. Without Michael’s constant encouragement it is unlikely that I would have embarked upon the research reported in this thesis, and it is Michael who introduced me to the inherent possibilities of the existential phenomenological approach to qualitative research, and to life in general. This attitude has enriched my life immeasurably.

During this project my family has offered constant patience, support and encouragement. My daughters Belinda, Margaret and Alison have strongly supported my return to study after some years spent in the domestic wilderness, and our endless discussions have been invaluable to the formulation and clarification of my thoughts and ideas. My husband Brent has contributed to this supportive environment in countless ways, and I thank him particularly for his sound editorial advice during the latter stages of the project.

I pay tribute to my friend and colleague, Liz Morrison, who, having also cared for her mother who died while this research was in progress, is thoroughly attuned to its aspirations. Our discussions on this and many other topics have been invaluable in stimulating and maintaining my enthusiasm for the project.

I thank the participants who have so generously contributed to the study, and without whom research of this type is not possible. Their experiences as carers cannot be quantified, and in this thesis I have attempted to present them in a form which celebrates caring as a feature of the human condition. I have benefited in many ways from our conversations during which they told of their experiences of caring, and trust that their inherent reflective attitudes serve them well in their future lives.

Finally, this thesis commemorates the life of my mother. The ultimate legacy of the experience of caring for her for the last few years of her life is that I have, through this study which was initiated in that experience, reached an understanding of the value of a phenomenological approach to life.

*    *    *
With the drawing of this Love and the voice of this Calling
We shall not cease from exploration
And the end of all our exploring
Will be to arrive where we started
And know the place for the first time.

T. S. Eliot: Little Gidding