Resolving the culture conundrum:  
A conceptual framework for the management of culture in TESOL

Submitted by


A thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

School of Educational Studies
Faculty of Education

La Trobe University
Bundoora, Victoria 3086
Australia

May 2005
Contents

List of Figures ........................................................................................................................................... vi
List of Tables ............................................................................................................................................... vii
Abstract .................................................................................................................................................... xi
Statement of Authorship ........................................................................................................................ xii
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................................................ xiii

Chapter 1: Investigating the 'cultural conundrum' of TESOL.............................................. 1
1.1 ‘Culture’ and ‘TESOL’ ........................................................................................................................ 1
1.2 The contexts and nature of TESOL ................................................................................................. 1
1.3 The TESOL profession and its discourses ...................................................................................... 5
1.4 Culture and communicative language teaching ............................................................................ 6
1.5 Starting points for the study ........................................................................................................... 7
1.6 The possibility of a ‘culture conundrum’ ....................................................................................... 11
1.7 The context of the study ............................................................................................................... 13
1.8 The nature of teaching, teacher education and research in education ...................................... 15
1.9 The nature of the study ............................................................................................................... 16
1.10 The process of the investigation and the structure of the thesis .............................................. 18

Chapter 2: Views from TESOL classrooms: the ‘culture conundrum’ at work? ............ 21
2.1 Introduction ......................................................................................................................................... 21
2.2 The context and nature of the survey ............................................................................................ 23
2.2.1 The methodology of the study .................................................................................................. 23
2.3.2 The survey instrument ............................................................................................................ 27
2.3.3 Distribution and Response ...................................................................................................... 30
2.3.4 Data analysis ........................................................................................................................... 32
2.3 Findings of the survey .................................................................................................................... 33
2.3.1 Characteristics of respondent teachers ................................................................................... 33
2.3.2 The professional discourse of the teachers in relation to the place of culture in TESOL ........ 34
2.3.3 Consistent responses from the teachers .................................................................................. 35
2.3.3.1 The role of the teachers ..................................................................................................... 35
2.3.3.2 The teachers’ approaches to teaching culture ................................................................. 39
2.3.3.3 The impact and nature of Curriculum frameworks ......................................................... 44
2.3.3.4 The value and impact of immigration and the value of multiculturalism ..................... 47
2.3.3.5 Attitudes to professional development on issues related to culture ................................ 49
2.3.4 Contradictions or tension in the responses of the teachers
2.3.4.1 The relationship between language and culture
2.3.4.2 The formation or changing of identities
2.3.4.3 Participation in Australian society
2.4 Discussion: Evidence of the ‘culture conundrum’?
2.5 The impact of the study on the design of professional development on the place of culture in TESOL

Chapter 3: Views from the library: Culture in the TESOL literature
3.1 Introduction
3.2 The nature of the literature
3.3 Perspectives on culture in the TESOL literature
3.4 The Conventional perspective: Application of anthropologically derived understandings of culture to communicative language teaching
3.4.1 The Conventional perspective in the period of Behaviourist Decline to Communicative Orthodoxy
3.4.2 The ‘Explicit’ exploration of culture in language teaching
3.4.3 Descriptions of learners’ backgrounds
3.4.4 ‘Implicit’ treatment of culture: culture in models of ‘communicative competence’
3.4.5 The Conventional perspective in the early 21st century
3.4.5.1 The extension of the Conventional perspective
3.4.5.2 Revisionism
3.4.6 The Conventional perspective and the culture conundrum
3.5 Systemic functional linguistics
3.5.1 The perspective of Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL)
3.5.2 SFL and the culture conundrum
3.6 Explorations of the nature of culture and communicative language teaching in the Expanding circle
3.6.1 The ‘Culture in context’ perspective
3.6.2 The ‘Culture in context’ perspective and the culture conundrum
3.7 The Practical perspective: Classroom resources for teaching aspects of culture
3.7.1 The Practical perspective
3.7.2 Frameworks for teaching language and culture
3.7.3 Collections of ideas for culture teaching activities
3.7.4 ‘Course books’ on teaching about culture
3.7.5 Other ideas for culture teaching activities
3.7.6 The Practical perspective and the culture conundrum
3.8 Critical and Postructuralist theory
3.8.1 Critical Applied Linguistics
3.8.2 Post structural perspectives on cultural learning and teaching
5.4.1 The goals of cultural teaching and learning in TESOL ........................................ 178
5.4.2 Understanding of the context of teaching .......................................................... 178
  5.4.2.1 The ‘Context’ dimension ........................................................................ 178
  5.4.2.2 The ‘Context’ factors ............................................................................. 179
5.4.3 Understanding of what is being taught: The relevant cultures of English ...... 182
  5.4.3.1 The ‘Cultures of English’ dimension ..................................................... 182
  5.4.3.2 The ‘Cultures of English’ factors ............................................................ 183
5.4.4 Culture in the curriculum .................................................................................. 186
  5.4.4.1 The ‘Culture in the curriculum’ dimension ........................................... 186
  5.4.4.2 The ‘Culture in the curriculum’ factors ................................................ 187
5.4.5 The methodological options .............................................................................. 190
  5.4.5.1 The ‘Methodology’ dimension ............................................................... 190
  5.4.5.2 The ‘Methodology’ Factors .................................................................... 190
5.4.6 Professional practice ....................................................................................... 192
  5.4.6.1 The ‘Professional practice’ dimension .................................................. 192
  5.4.6.2 The ‘Professional development’ factors ............................................... 193
5.4.7 The underlying principles .................................................................................. 194
  5.4.7.1 The ‘socially situated’ principle .............................................................. 195
  5.4.7.2 The ‘language-culture connection’ principle ......................................... 195
  5.4.7.3 The ‘multidimensional’ principle ............................................................ 195
  5.4.7.4 The ‘fuzziness’ principle ....................................................................... 196
  5.4.7.5 The ‘relativity’ principle ........................................................................ 196
  5.4.7.6 The ‘access’ principle .......................................................................... 197
  5.4.7.7 The ‘explicit attention and exploration’ principle .................................. 198
  5.4.7.8 The ‘contrastive’ principle ..................................................................... 199
  5.4.7.9 The ‘internalisation and appropriation’ principle ................................... 199
  5.4.7.10 The ‘teacher reflection’ principle ......................................................... 200
5.5 Escaping the culture conundrum ......................................................................... 200

Chapter 6: Applying the framework: finding escape routes from the culture conundrum in TESOL practice, teacher education and research ................. 202

6.1 The scope of the chapter ...................................................................................... 202
6.2 Application of the framework to TESOL practice .............................................. 203
  6.2.1 TESOL in an Inner circle context: teaching ESL in Australia to recently arrived adult immigrants in the AMEP ........................................ 204
  6.2.2 Comment on the description of the AMEP generated by the framework ...... 208
  6.2.3 Guidance provided by the framework in enacting the teaching of culture in the AMEP ................................................................. 208
6.3 Application of the framework to an Expanding circle context ........................... 212
  6.3.1 TESOL for young adults in a university in Vietnam ..................................... 212
List of Figures

Figure 2.1: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.6........................................36
Figure 2.2: The distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 5.10 ...............................40
Figure 2.3: The distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 5.12 ...............................41
Figure 2.4: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.7.1.................................42
Figure 2.5: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.7.2.................................43
Figure 2.6: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.7.3.................................43
Figure 2.7: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 5.12.................................47
Figure 2.8: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.3........................................52
Figure 2.9: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 2.7.................................54
Figure 2.10: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 2.8.................................55
Figure 2.11: Distribution of responses to questionnaire Item 4.2.................................57
Figure 3.1: Perspectives on culture in the TESOL literature.................................72
Figure 3.2: The Conventional perspective from the period of Behaviourist Decline to
    Communicative Orthodoxy.................................................................76
Figure 3.3: Recent developments in the Conventional perspective: Extension and
    Revision .................................................................................................84
Figure 3.4: The Perspective of Systemic Functional Linguistics .....................................88
Figure 3.5: The Culture in context perspective.........................................................90
Figure 3.6: The Practical perspective: Classroom resources for teaching culture.............96
Figure 3.7: The perspectives of Critical Applied Linguistics and Critical and Post
    structuralist theory ...............................................................................104
Figure 3.8: The Sociocultural perspective ...............................................................110
Figure 3.9: The Perspective of Intercultural Language Teaching................................113
List of Tables

Table 2.1: Overview of distribution of survey instrument .......................................................... 31
Table 2.2: Number of respondents by sector ............................................................................ 34
Table 4.1: Crozet & Liddicoat’s points of articulation between culture and language ........... 140
Table 4.2: A model of cultural teaching and learning ............................................................... 143
Table 4.3: Factors in Byram’s model of intercultural communicative competence ............... 145
Table 4.4: Some possible variations in patterns in the ‘Ideological’ dimensions of English-Vietnamese bilingualism in different contexts ........................................... 151
Table 4.5: Characteristics of different sources of cultural input in different contexts.......... 155
Table 4.6: Components of techniques for teaching culture ..................................................... 163
Table 5.1: A conceptual framework for enactment of a culture curriculum in TESOL ............ 176
Table 6.1: Applying the framework in an Inner circle context: Teaching ESL to recently arrived adult immigrants in the AMEP ............................................................. 205
Table 6.2: Identification of cultural content and learning activities related to CSWE Stage 1, Module C, LO1 ............................................................................................. 209
Table 6.3: Application of the framework to an Expanding circle context: English language teaching to young adult learners in a university English department in Vietnam ........................................................... 214
Table 6.4: Identification of cultural content and cultural learning activities for the teaching topic ‘meeting someone for the first time’ in the ‘Speaking’ component of a general English course in a Vietnamese university ........................................... 218
Table 6.5: Culture in TESOL teacher education and professional development: pre-service and in-service ........................................................................ 226

Appendix 2 Tables

Demographic and Professional backgrounds of the teachers
Table A2.1: Age of the teachers .................................................................................. 257
Table A2.2: Gender of the teachers ............................................................................. 258
Table A2.3: Identity of the teachers ............................................................................. 258
Table A2.4: Nature of the highest TESOL qualification held by the teachers .......... 258
Table A2.5: The teachers’ TESOL experience in years ............................................. 258
Table A2.6: Location of the teachers’ workplaces ...................................................... 258

Teachers’ perceptions of the cultural learning needs of students in TESOL programs
Table A2.7: Classification of responses to item 2.1 .................................................... 259
Table A2.8: Examples of responses in each category for item 2.1 ......................... 259
Table A2.9: Distribution of responses to item 2.1 .................................................... 260
Table A2.10: Classification of responses to item 2.2 ................................................ 260
Table A2.11: Examples of responses in each category in item 2.2 ........................................... 260
Table A2.12: Distribution of responses for item 2.2 ................................................................. 261
Table A2.13: Classification of responses to item 2.6 ............................................................... 261
Table A2.14: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.6 ................. 261
Table A2.15: Distribution of responses to item 2.6 ................................................................. 261
Table A2.16: Distribution of responses to item 5.2 ................................................................. 262
Table A2.17: Distribution of responses to item 5.3 ................................................................. 262
Table A2.18: Distribution of responses to item 5.4 ................................................................. 263
Table A2.19: Distribution of responses to item 5.5 ................................................................. 263
Table A2.20: Distribution of responses to item 5.19 ............................................................... 264

Table A2.21: Classification of responses to item 2.4 ........................................................... 265
Table A2.22: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.4 .............. 265
Table A2.23: Distribution of responses to item 2.4 ................................................................. 265
Table A2.24: Classification of responses to item 2.5 ............................................................. 265
Table A2.25: Examples of responses in each category in response to item 2.5 ............. 266
Table A2.26: Distribution of responses to item 2.5 ................................................................. 266
Table A2.27: Distribution of responses to item 3.2 ................................................................. 267
Table A2.28: Distribution of responses to item 4.6 ................................................................. 267
Table A2.29: Distribution of responses to item 5.6 ................................................................. 268
Table A2.30: Distribution of responses to item 5.7 ................................................................. 268
Table A2.31: Distribution of responses to item 5.8 ................................................................. 269
Table A2.32: Distribution of responses to item 6.1 ................................................................. 269
Table A2.33: Distribution of responses to item 6.1.1 ............................................................. 269
Table A2.34: Distribution of results to item 6.2 ...................................................................... 270
Table A2.35: Distribution of results to item 6.2.2 ................................................................. 270

Teachers' views of their roles in the settlement of learners in Australian society

Table A2.36: Classification of responses to item 2.3 ........................................................... 271
Table A2.37: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.3 .......... 271
Table A2.38: Distribution of responses to item 2.3 ................................................................. 271
Table A2.39: Distribution of responses to item 2.7 ................................................................. 272
Table A2.40: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.7 ....... 272
Table A2.41: Distribution of responses to item 2.7 ................................................................. 272
Table A2.42: Classification of responses to item 2.9 ............................................................. 273
Table A2.43: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.9 ........ 273
Table A2.44: Distribution of responses to item 2.9 ................................................................. 273
Table A2.45: Distribution of results for item 4.1 ................................................................. 274
Table A2.46: Distribution of responses to item 4.2 ................................................................. 274
Table A2.47: Distribution of responses to item 4.3 ................................................................. 275
Table A2.48: Distribution of results for item 4.7.1 ............................................................. 276
Table A2.49: Distribution of responses to item 4.8............................................................. 276
Table A2.50: Distribution of responses to item 5.9............................................................. 276

Approaches to teaching culture
Table A2.51: Classification of responses to item 2.8 .......................................................... 278
Table A2.52: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.8 ....... 278
Table A2.53: Distribution of responses to item 2.8 ............................................................. 278
Table A2.54: Distribution of responses to item 4.5 ............................................................. 279
Table A2.55: Distribution of responses to item 4.7.2 (teaching of cultural knowledge) ............................................................. 279
Table A2.56: Distribution of results to item 4.7.3 (teaching ways of acting and reacting) ............................................................. 280
Table A2.57: Distribution of results for item 4.7.4 (teaching sense of identity as a member of a group) ............................................................. 280
Table A2.58: Distribution of responses to item 5.1 ............................................................. 281
Table A2.59: Distribution of responses to item 5.10 ............................................................ 281
Table A2.60: Distribution of responses to item 5.11 ............................................................ 281
Table A2.61: Distribution of responses to item 5.12 ............................................................ 282
Table A2.62: Distribution of responses to item 5.13 ............................................................ 282
Table A2.63: Distribution of responses to item 5.14 ............................................................ 283
Table A2.64: Distribution of responses to item 5.15 ............................................................ 283

Teachers' views on the impact of curriculum frameworks on their teaching of culture
Table A2.65: Classification of responses to item 2.13 .......................................................... 284
Table A2.66: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.13 ....... 284
Table A2.67: Distribution of responses to item 2.13 ............................................................ 284
Table A2.68: Classification of responses to item 2.14 .......................................................... 284
Table A2.69: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 2.14 ....... 284
Table A2.70: Distribution of responses to item 2.14 ............................................................ 285
Table A2.71: Distribution of results to item 3.6 ................................................................. 285
Table A2.72: Distribution of responses to item 3.7 ............................................................. 286
Table A2.73: Distribution of responses to item 4.10 ............................................................. 286
Table A2.74: Distribution of responses for item 4.11 .......................................................... 287
Table A2.75: Distribution of responses for item 5.20 .......................................................... 287
Table A2.76: Distribution of responses for item 5.21 .......................................................... 288
Table A2.77: Distribution of responses for item 5.22 .......................................................... 288
Table A2.78: Distribution of responses for item 5.23 .......................................................... 289

Teachers' views on the value of immigration and multiculturalism in the development of Australia
Table A2.79: Distribution of responses for item 2.10 .......................................................... 290
Table A2.80: Examples of responses of teachers who were ‘more committed’ in item 2.10 ................................................................. 290
Table A2.81: Examples of responses of teachers whose commitment was ‘about the same’ in item 2.10 ................................................................. 290
Table A2.82: Distribution of responses for item 3.3 ................................................................. 292
Table A2.83: Distribution of responses for item 5.16 ................................................................. 292
Table A2.84: Distribution of responses for item 5.17 ................................................................. 293
Table A2.85: Distribution of responses for item 5.18 ................................................................. 293

Teachers' views on the nature of multiculturalism
Table A2.86: Distribution of responses for item 3.5 ................................................................. 294
Table A2.87: Distribution of responses for item 4.9 ................................................................. 294
Table A2.88: Classification of responses to item 6.7 ................................................................. 295
Table A2.89: Examples of responses in each category of response to item 6.7 ........ 295
Table A2.90: Distribution of responses for item 6.7 ................................................................. 295

Attitudes to professional development on these issues
Table A2.91: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.1 ................................................................. 296
Table A2.92: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.2 ................................................................. 296
Table A2.93: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.3 ................................................................. 297
Table A2.94: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.4 ................................................................. 297
Table A2.95: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.5 ................................................................. 297
Table A2.96: Distribution of responses for item 6.4.6 ................................................................. 298
Table A2.97: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.1 ................................................................. 298
Table A2.98: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.2 ................................................................. 298
Table A2.99: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.3 ................................................................. 299
Table A2.100: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.4 ............................................................... 299
Table A2.101: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.5 ............................................................... 300
Table A2.102: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.6 ............................................................... 300
Table A2.103: Distribution of responses for item 6.5.7 ............................................................... 300
Abstract

The thesis explores the place of culture in the teaching of English to speakers of other languages (TESOL). The study originally set out to investigate the ways in which teachers understand culture and deal with it in their teaching of English. A survey of teachers found that while the teachers had sophisticated understandings about culture and its relationship with language at a general level, they did not have clear understandings about how cultural teaching can be enacted in the classroom. This conundrum was also evident in the literature on teaching culture in TESOL. An extensive survey of the literature found that while there are a number of different perspectives on how culture can be understood and dealt with in TESOL, none of these provide a comprehensive basis for the understandings teachers need for the practicalities of teaching. The focus of the study shifted from an investigation of professional development to the articulation of a conceptual framework to inform teachers in the way they can manage the teaching of culture. The framework draws on some significant insights of one of the perspectives in the literature, Intercultural Language Teaching, as well as some insights from other perspectives. The framework identifies dimensions in which teachers need to understand how culture can be manifest and managed in TESOL. For each dimension a number of factors on which decisions need to be made are identified. The framework also identifies a number of principles to guide teachers in their decision-making about the teaching culture. The potential of the framework to inform the teaching of English to adult immigrants in Australia, as well as students studying English in a university in Vietnam is explored. The capacity of the framework to inform TESOL teacher education, research and theory building is also evaluated.
Statement of authorship

Except where reference is made in the text of the thesis, this thesis contains no material published elsewhere or extracted in whole or in part from a thesis submitted for the award of any other degree or diploma.

No other person’s work has been used without due acknowledgement in the main text of the thesis.

The thesis has not been submitted for the award of any degree or diploma in any other tertiary institution.

The research procedures reported in the thesis were approved by the Human Research Ethics Committee of the Graduate School of Education.

Signature:……………………………………..Date……………………
Acknowledgements

Many people have generously assisted me in a variety of ways in completing this thesis.

My supervisor, Dr Keith Simkin provided warm, expert, considered and considerate guidance and support over the nine years on which I have worked on the research that has resulted in this thesis. He has helped me to see more in what I encountered and wrote than what I originally thought was there, as well as sharing his knowledge of the content and the skills required to undertake and complete this research.

Many of my colleagues in what is now the School of Educational Studies at La Trobe University have assisted me in a variety of ways during this time, but the encouragement of Dr Lloyd Holliday, Dr. Helen Moore, Dr. Howard Nicholas and Dr. Lynda Yates has been especially helpful. In particular the conversations in aircraft cabins and taxis conducted with Lynda and Howard whilst completing duties interstate have been valuable in challenging and extending my thinking. Associate Professor Lorraine Ling has assisted me in the adoption of strategies to enable completion of the research within a heavy workload. Professor Gilah Leder and Julia Anderson of the Institute of Advanced Studies at La Trobe University provided a haven away from the interruptions and distractions of the office that enabled me to concentrate, think and write, and bring together many divergent threads in the final 15 months of the work. Tricia McCann has been a fellow traveller on the journey of doctoral research whose informal peer debriefings have helped me to better understand what I have been doing. Colleagues who work in other institutions also provided constant encouragement, especially Dr. Chris Davison of the University of Hong Kong and Dr Sophie Arkoudis of the University of Melbourne. In brief conversations, Professor Denise Murray of the AMEP Research Centre at Macquarie University and Martyn Brogan of AMES Victoria made comments which proved catalytic in terms of shaping the research. At an earlier stage of my career, Bilal Cleland laid a significant foundation of this research with the insight he gave to me into an Islamic view of the world and way of life. His constant reminders of the ways the experiences and unconscious assumptions of Australians of our generation shape
our perceptions and influence our reactions to what we encounter in cross-cultural interaction gave me an initial awareness of many of the issues I have explored in this thesis.

My thinking has also been influenced by the many hundreds of ESL and TESOL teacher education students I have taught. In recent years, many of my students and teachers participating in professional development activities, have given me valuable feedback as my thinking has developed. In particular, the students in La Trobe’s Master of Applied Linguistics programs in Vietnam, and colleagues in La Trobe’s partner universities in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City have, with characteristic generosity and warmth, shared a Vietnamese view of the world with me, and stimulated my thinking about the way English operates as an ‘International Language’ in the context of contemporary global politics and economic conditions.

The sixty-four anonymous teachers who made the effort to respond to my excessively long questionnaire in 1998 deserve special mention, as do Janine Breadmore, Pam Luizzi and Jacky Springall for the assistance they provided in trialing the questionnaire. Helen Neville provided invaluable assistance in proof reading the final draft.

But most of all, I could not have completed the thesis and survived without the love and support of my family. Maureen, Luke (who we now miss so much), Anna and Ciaran, have supported and encouraged me, as well as reminding me that there is more to life than the completion of a research project and thesis. They have graciously tolerated my changes in temperament and mood as things have gone well and not so well, and they have tolerated my absence and distraction at times when they were entitled to more of my time and attention.